

WILLIAM S. HUNT 1259-0
JENNY J.N.A. NAKAMOTO 9780-0

DENTONS US LLP
1001 Bishop Street, Suite 1800
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813-3689
Telephone: (808) 524-1800
Facsimile: (808) 524-4591
E-mail: bill.hunt@dentons.com
jenny.nakamoto@dentons.com

JOEL M. TAYLOR (Pro Hac Vice)
1000 Watchtower Drive
Patterson, New York 12563
Telephone: (845) 306-0700
Email: jmtaylor@jw.org

Attorneys for Defendants/Crossclaimants
MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S
WITNESSES, HAWAII and WATCHTOWER BIBLE
AND TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC.

Electronically Filed
FIRST CIRCUIT
1CCV-20-0000390
19-APR-2022
08:18 PM
Dkt. 380 OGEP

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE FIRST CIRCUIT
STATE OF HAWAII

N.D.,

Plaintiff,

vs.

MAKAHA, HAWAII CONGREGATION
OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, a Hawaii
non-profit unincorporated religious
organization, a.k.a. MAKAHA
CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S
WITNESSES and KINGDOM HALL,
MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF
JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES;
WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT
SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC., a New
York corporation; KENNETH L. APANA,
Individually; and Does 1 through 100,
inclusive,

Defendants.

Civil No. 1CCV-20-0000390 DEO
(OTHER NON-VEHICLE TORT)

**ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANTS' EX
PARTE MOTION TO FILE UNDER
SEAL EXHIBITS "A" and "C" TO
DEFENDANTS/ CROSSCLAIMANTS
MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF
JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, HAWAII and
WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT
SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC.'S
MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO
PLAINTIFF'S RULE 37 MOTION TO
HOLD THE DEFENDANTS IN
CONTEMPT FOR FAILURE TO COMPLY
WITH THE COURT'S ORDER AND FOR
THE IMPOSITION OF SANCTIONS
INCLUDING THE ENTRY OF
JUDGMENT ON THE ISSUE OF
LIABILITY PURSUANT TO RULE
37(b)(2)(B) AND FOR THE ADDITIONAL
SANCTION OF REVOCATION OF PRO
HAC VICE STATUS OF JOEL TAYLOR
FILED APRIL 5, 2022 [DOC. 333]**

MAKAHA, HAWAII CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, a Hawaii non-profit unincorporated religious organization, a.k.a. MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES and KINGDOM HALL, MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES; and WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC., a New York corporation,

Crossclaimants,

vs.

KENNETH L. APANA, Individually,

Crossclaim Defendant.

ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANTS' *EX PARTE* MOTION TO FILE UNDER SEAL EXHIBITS "A" and "C" TO DEFENDANTS/ CROSSCLAIMANTS MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, HAWAII and WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC.'S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S RULE 37 MOTION TO HOLD THE DEFENDANTS IN CONTEMPT FOR FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE COURT'S ORDER AND FOR THE IMPOSITION OF SANCTIONS INCLUDING THE ENTRY OF JUDGMENT ON THE ISSUE OF LIABILITY PURSUANT TO RULE 37(b)(2)(B) AND FOR THE ADDITIONAL SANCTION OF REVOCATION OF PRO HAC VICE STATUS OF JOEL TAYLOR FILED APRIL 5, 2022 [DOC. 333]

Upon consideration of Defendants Makaha Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Hawai'i and Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of New York, Inc.'s *Ex Parte* Motion to File Under Seal Exhibits "A" and "C" to Defendants/Crossclaimants Makaha Congregation of Jehovah's Witnesses, Hawaii and Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of New York, Inc.'s Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Rule 37 Motion to Hold the Defendants in Contempt for Failure to Comply with the Court's Order and for the Imposition of Sanctions Including the Entry of Judgment on the Issue of Liability Pursuant to Rule 37(B)(2)(B) and for the Additional Sanction of Revocation of Pro Hac Vice Status of Joel Taylor filed April 5, 2022 [Doc. 333] ("*Ex Parte* Motion"), the files and records herein, and good cause appearing therefor,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the *Ex Parte* Motion is GRANTED. Copies of Exhibits “A” and “C” to Defendants/Crossclaimants Makaha Congregation of Jehovah’s Witnesses, Hawaii and Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of New York, Inc.’s Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff’s Rule 37 Motion to Hold the Defendants in Contempt for Failure to Comply with the Court’s Order and for the Imposition of Sanctions Including the Entry of Judgment on the Issue of Liability Pursuant to Rule 37(B)(2)(B) and for the Additional Sanction of Revocation of Pro Hac Vice Status of Joel Taylor filed April 5, 2022 [Doc. 333], shall be placed and filed under seal.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai‘i April 19, 2022.

/s/ Dean E. Ochiai



JUDGE OF THE ABOVE ENTITLED COURT

N.D. v. MAKAHA, HAWAII CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH’S WITNESSES, a Hawaii non-profit unincorporated religious organization, a.k.a. MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH’S WITNESSES and KINGDOM HALL, MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH’S WITNESSES, et al.; Civil No. 1CCV-20-0000390 DEO; Circuit Court of the First Circuit, State of Hawai‘i; **ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANTS’ EX PARTE MOTION TO FILE UNDER SEAL EXHIBITS “A” and “C” TO DEFENDANTS/ CROSSCLAIMANTS MAKAHA CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH’S WITNESSES, HAWAII and WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC.’S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF’S RULE 37 MOTION TO HOLD THE DEFENDANTS IN CONTEMPT FOR FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE COURT’S ORDER AND FOR THE IMPOSITION OF SANCTIONS INCLUDING THE ENTRY OF JUDGMENT ON THE ISSUE OF LIABILITY PURSUANT TO RULE 37(b)(2)(B) AND FOR THE ADDITIONAL SANCTION OF REVOCATION OF PRO HAC VICE STATUS OF JOEL TAYLOR FILED APRIL 5, 2022 [DOC. 333]**