

Robert L. Stepan
Ryan R. Shaffer
James C. Murnion
Victoria K.M. Gannon
Meyer, Shaffer & Stepan, PLLP
430 Ryman Street
Missoula, MT 59802
Tel: (406) 543-6929
Fax: (406) 721-1799
rob@mss-lawfirm.com
ryan@mss-lawfirm.com
james@mss-lawfirm.com
katy@mss-lawfirm.com

Matthew L. Merrill (appearing *pro hac vice*)
Merrill Law, LLC
1401 Delgany St. #404
Denver, CO 80202
Tel: (303) 947-4453
matthew@merrillwaterlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA
BILLINGS DIVISION**

TRACY CAEKAERT, and CAMILLIA)
MAPLEY,)

Plaintiffs,)

vs.)

WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT)
SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC., and)
WATCH TOWER BIBLE AND TRACT)
SOCIETY OF PENNSYLVANIA.,)

Defendants,)

Case No. CV-20-52-BLG-SPW

**PLAINTIFFS' STATEMENT
OF EXPENSES AND FEES
RE: ECF NO. 411**

Pursuant to the Court's Order of June 10, 2024, Plaintiffs hereby submit the following pleading setting forth the amount of expenses and attorney's fees "related to WTNY's Motion for Protective Order and Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike

and preparing the instant motion.” Ord. at 13, ECF No. 411.¹ As ordered, attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is the Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer.

The Court has broad discretion in calculating the fees and costs appropriate for a discovery sanction. *Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co. v. Haeger*, 581 U.S. 101, 110 (2017) (citing *Fox v. Vice*, 563 U.S. 826, 838 (2011)). The purpose of sanctioning a party for discovery abuses is to compensate for “all expenses, whenever incurred, that would not have been sustained had the opponent conducted itself properly.” *Kraszewski v. State Farm General Ins. Co.*, No. C 79-1261 THE, 1984 WL 1027, at *5 (N.D. Cal. June 11, 1984).

PLAINTIFFS’ EXPENSES AND ATTORNEY’S FEES

The Court has ordered Defendant Watchtower Bible and Tract Society of New York, Inc. (“WTNY”) to pay Plaintiffs’ expenses related to WTNY’s Motion for Protective Order (ECF No. 234), Plaintiffs’ Motion to Strike (ECF No. 248), and Plaintiffs’ Motion for Sanctions (ECF No. 362). The expenses related to each is set forth below

1. WTNY’s Motion for Protective Order (ECF No. 234)

Plaintiffs’ expenses and attorney’s fees expended litigating WTNY’s Motion for Protective Order are as follows:

¹ It is Plaintiffs’ understanding that the parties have agreed on terms to settle these cases. Counsel shall inform the Court whether the final settlement terms include resolution of fees and expenses Ordered by the Court.

- \$9,600.00 in attorney fees. Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer,
- \$300.00 in paralegal fees. Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer,

2. Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike (ECF No. 248)

Plaintiffs' expenses and attorney's fees expended litigating Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike are as follows:

- \$6,400.00 in attorney fees. Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer,
- \$450.00 in paralegal fees. Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer,

3. Plaintiffs' Motion for Sanctions (ECF No. 362)

Plaintiffs' expenses and attorney's fees expended litigating Plaintiffs' Motion for Sanctions are as follows:

- \$1,400.00 in attorney fees. Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer,
- \$637.50 in paralegal fees. Affidavit of Ryan Shaffer,

CONCLUSION

As set forth above, and as supported by the affidavit of Ryan Shaffer, the expenses and attorney's fees Plaintiffs are entitled to recover because of WTNY's discovery misconduct is:

Item	Dollar Amount
Attorney's Fees	\$17,400.00
Paralegal Expenses	\$1,387.50
Total	\$18,787.50

DATED this 10th day of July, 2024.

By: /s/ Ryan Shaffer
Ryan R. Shaffer
MEYER, SHAFFER & STEPANS PLLP

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to Local Rule 1.4, this document has been served on all parties via electronic service through the Court's Case Management/Electronic Case Filing (CM/ECF) system.

By: /s/ Ryan Shaffer
Ryan R. Shaffer
MEYER, SHAFFER & STEPANS PLLP

Attorneys for Plaintiffs